

BRUCE E. GERSTEIN
SCOTT W. FISHER
JOSEPH OPPER
NOAH H. SILVERMAN
KIMBERLY M. HENNINGS
ELENA K. CHAN
JONATHAN M. GERSTEIN
DAN LITVIN

GARWIN GERSTEIN & FISHER LLP

COUNSELORS AT LAW

WALL STREET PLAZA

88 PINE STREET, 10TH FLOOR

NEW YORK, N.Y. 10005

(212) 398-0055

FAX No. (212) 764-6620

Sender's email address: dlitvin@garwingerstein.com

SIDNEY L. GARWIN
(1908-1980)

--

ANNA TYDNIUK
AAKRUTI VAKHARIA

October 7, 2020

Via ECF

The Honorable Alvin K. Hellerstein
United States District Court
Southern District of New York
500 Pearl Street, Room 1050
New York, New York 10007

RE: *In re Novartis and Par Antitrust Litigation*, 1:18-cv-04361; all actions

Dear Judge Hellerstein,

Pursuant to footnote one of the May 20, 2020 Scheduling Order (ECF No. 243), the Parties hereby jointly submit as Exhibit A hereto a Stipulated Revised Proposed Joint Scheduling Order.

Respectfully,

/s/ Dan Litvin

Dan Litvin

By: /s/ Dan Litvin

Bruce E. Gerstein

Joseph Oppen

Dan Litvin

GARWIN GERSTEIN & FISHER LLP

88 Pine Street, 10th Floor

New York, NY 10005

Tel: (212) 398-0055

Fax: (212) 764-6620

bgerstein@garwingerstein.com

jopper@garwingerstein.com

dlitvin@garwingerstein.com

*Attorneys for Plaintiff Drogueria Betances,
LLC and interim lead counsel for the direct
purchaser class*

David Raphael

Erin Leger

Susan Segura

SMITH SEGURA & RAPHAEL, LLP

3600 Jackson St., Ste. 111

Alexandria, LA 71303

Tel: (318) 445-4480

Fax: (318) 487-1741

draphael@ssrllp.com

eleger@ssrllp.com

ssegura@ssrllp.com

John Gregory Odom

Stuart Des Roches

Andrew Kelly

Dan Chiorean

ODOM & DES ROCHES

Poydras Center

650 Poydras Street, Suite 2020

New Orleans, LA 70130

Tel: (504) 522-0077

Fax: (504) 522-0078

jodom@odrlaw.com

stuart@odrlaw.com

akelly@odrlaw.com

dchiorean@odrlaw.com

Russell A. Chorush

Miranda Jones

By: /s/ Robin A. van der Meulen

Gregory S. Ascioffa

Robin A. van der Meulen

LABATON SUCHAROW LLP

140 Broadway

New York, New York 10005

Tel: (212) 907-0700

Fax: (212) 818-0477

gascioffa@labaton.com

rvandermeulen@labaton.com

*Attorneys for Plaintiff UFCW Local 1500
Welfare Fund and interim lead counsel for
the end-payor class*

Robert G. Eisler

Deborah A. Elman

Kelly L. Tucker (*pro hac vice*)

Chad B. Holtzman

GRANT & EISENHOFER P.A.

485 Lexington Avenue

New York, NY 10017

Tel.: (646) 722-8500

Fax: (646) 722-8501

reisler@gelaw.com

delman@gelaw.com

choltzman@gelaw.com

ktucker@gelaw.com

*Attorneys for Plaintiff Law Enforcement
Health Benefits Inc. and the end-payor class*

By: /s/ Lauren C. Ravkind

Richard Alan Arnold

Scott E. Perwin

Lauren C. Ravkind

Anna T. Neill

Joshua Gray

KENNY NACHWALTER P.A.

Four Seasons Tower

1441 Brickell Avenue, Suite 1100

Miami, FL 33131

Tel: (305) 373-1000

Fax: (305) 372-1861

sperwin@knpa.com

lravkind@knpa.com

HEIM PAYNE & CHORUSH LLP

1111 Bagby, Suite 2100
Houston, TX 77002
Tel: (713) 221-2000
Fax: (713) 221-2021
rchorush@hpcllp.com
mjones@hpcllp.com

*Additional Attorneys for Plaintiff Drogueria
Betances, LLC and for the direct purchaser
class*

Kristyn Fields
FARUQI & FARUQI, LLP
685 Third Ave., Floor 26
New York, NY 10017
Tel.: (212) 983-9330
Fax: (212) 983-9331
kfields@faruqilaw.com

Peter Kohn
Joseph T. Lukens
FARUQI & FARUQI, LLP
101 Greenwood Ave., Suite 600
Jenkintown, PA 19046
Tel: (215) 277-5770
pkohn@faruqilaw.com
jluken@faruqilaw.com

David F. Sorensen
Caitlin G. Coslett
BERGER MONTAGUE PC
1818 Market Street, Suite 3600
Philadelphia, PA 19103
Tel: (215) 875-3000
dsorensen@bm.net
ccoslett@bm.net

*Attorneys for Plaintiff Rochester Drug Co-
Operative, Inc. and the direct purchaser class*

Robert N. Kaplan
Matthew P. McCahill

aneill@knpa.com

*Attorneys for Plaintiffs Walgreen Co., The
Kroger Co., and H-E-B, L.P.*

By: /s/ Eric L. Bloom
Alexander J. Egervary
Barry L. Refsin
Eric L. Bloom
**HANGLEY ARONCHICK SEGAL
PUDLIN & SCHILLER**
One Logan Square, 27th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19103
(215) 568-6200
aegervary@hanglely.com
brefsin@hanglely.com
ebloom@hanglely.com

*Attorneys for Plaintiffs CVS Pharmacy, Inc.,
Rite Aid Corporation & Rite Aid Hdqtrs.
Corp.*

By: /s/ Benjamin M. Greenblum
Benjamin M. Greenblum
Elise Baumgarten
Thomas Ryan
R. Chet Otis
WILLIAMS & CONNOLLY LLP
650 Fifth Avenue, Suite 1500
New York, New York 10019
Tel: (646) 949-2800
Fax: (646) 949-2801
bgreenblum@wc.com

*Attorneys for Defendant Par
Pharmaceutical, Inc.*

By: Julie A. North
Evan R. Chesler
Julie A. North
CRAVATH, SWAINE & MOORE LLP
825 Eighth Avenue
New York, New York 10019
Tel: (212) 474-1000
Fax: (212) 474-3700
echesler@cravath.com

Ralph E. Labaton
KAPLAN FOX & KILSHEIMER, LLP
850 Third Avenue, 14th Floor
New York, New York 10022
Tel: 212-687-1980
Fax: 212-687-7714
rkaplan@kaplanfox.com
mmccahill@kaplanfox.com
rlabaton@kaplanfox.com

jnorth@cravath.com

*Attorneys for Defendants Novartis
Pharmaceuticals Corporation and Novartis
AG*

Joseph M. Vanek
David P. Germaine
VANEK, VICKERS & MASINI P.C.
55 W. Monroe, Suite 3500
Chicago, Illinois 60603
Tel: 312-224-1500
Fax: 312-224-1510
jvanek@vaneklaw.com
dgermaine@vaneklaw.com

*Attorneys for Plaintiff FWK Holdings, LLC
and the direct purchaser class*

Michael L. Roberts
Debra G. Josephson
Stephanie E. Smith
ROBERTS LAW FIRM, P.A
20 Rahling Circle
Little Rock, AR 72223
Tel.: (501) 821-5575
Fax: (501) 821-4474
mikeroberts@robertslawfirm.us
debrajosephson@robertslawfirm.us
stephaniesmith@robertslawfirm.us

*Attorneys for Plaintiff KPH Healthcare
Services, Inc., a/k/a Kinney Drugs, Inc and
the direct purchaser class*

EXHIBIT A

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK**

In re Novartis and Par Antitrust Litigation	1:18-cv-04361-AKH
This Document Relates To:	
All Actions	

STIPULATED REVISED [PROPOSED] JOINT SCHEDULING ORDER

WHEREAS, on May 20, 2020 in light of the COVID-19 pandemic, the Court entered a scheduling order modifying the March 18, 2020 Scheduling Order through the start of depositions (ECF No. 243);

WHEREAS, the previous schedule required the Parties to file a Revised Joint Proposed Scheduling Order “[a]fter the first deposition to occur using the same sequencing and timing intervals set forth in the March 18, 2020 Scheduling Order (ECF No. 241)”. *Id.* at n.1;

WHEREAS, the first deposition took place on September 22, 2020;

ACCORDINGLY, IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND ORDERED THAT the following schedule will govern the events set forth below:

Event	Date
Close of fact depositions	1/8/2021
Status/Settlement conference	1/11/2021 (week of)
Plaintiffs serve opening class and merits expert reports	2/10/21
Defendants serve rebuttal class and merits expert reports	4/28/21
Status/Settlement conference	5/3/21 (week of)
Plaintiffs file motions for class certification	6/2/21
Defendants file oppositions to Plaintiffs’ motions for class certification	8/18/21
Plaintiffs file replies in further support of motions for class certification	9/29/21

SO ORDERED

Dated: _____

The Honorable Alvin K. Hellerstein
United States District Judge